Culture in counselling and psychotherapy

Dr. George MacDonald
22nd April 2016

Our most beautiful and complex artwork that we can make is our identity
Grayson Perry

What this is / is not

- This is not:
  - A conventional training day on culture
  - You will not learn anything about stereotypical cultures

- This is:
  - A workshop on culture / metaculture
  - You will learn about:
    - A new (supplementary) way to think about culture
    - A way to use it in therapy

Programme for the day

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>09:30-11:00</td>
<td>What is culture?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-11:15</td>
<td>Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15-12:30</td>
<td>Research findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:30-13:00</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00-14:15</td>
<td>Research and clinical data</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:15-14:30</td>
<td>Break</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:30-15:45</td>
<td>Wider social applications</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:45-16:00</td>
<td>Review of day GM/JL</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Introductory exercise

- Introduce yourself
- Expectations of day
- Optionally, what does culture mean to you

Reminder of context – video clip

Derald Wing Sue is a professor of counseling psychology at Columbia University. He has written several books, including Counseling the Culturally Diverse: Theory and Practice, Overcoming our Racism, and Understanding Abnormal Behavior.

Inspiration (Seeley, 2000: 72)

... research has shown that therapist’s knowledge about their patient’s cultural backgrounds has no bearing on patient’s therapeutic progress (Sue & Zane, 1987). Rather than learning about the stereotypical characteristics of particular cultures, psychotherapists need to become familiar with the general characteristics, categories and functions of culture per se.
Inspiration (Burman, 2004: 293-4) – Beyond enabling difference

how to acknowledge and work with structural axes of difference as creative and valuable resources? But, beyond this, how to work with such differences, rather than portraying them as obstacles to be overcome on the road to some fictional universalized state of complete, mutual understanding or relatedness?

Inspiration (Moodley, 2007: 1)

... three strategies for creating a ‘third space’ in multicultural counselling and psychotherapy: the inclusion of white people as clients; the convergence of race, gender, sexual orientation, class and disability issues; and the integration of indigenous and traditional healing practices. Bringing it all together under the umbrella of diversity or critical multiculturalism will ensure an ethical and clinical practice commensurate with our current understanding of the complexity and sophistication within which clients construct their subjectivity.

A new paradigm

- Technologies of communication, computing and travel
- End of empires
- Mass migration driven by economics and terror
- 'The relatively coherent and unified sense of self inherent in a traditional culture gives way to manifold and competing potentials ... The possibility for committed romanticism or strong single-minded modernism recedes, and the way is open for the postmodern being' Gergen (2000: 80)

What is culture

- Definitional difficulties (Kroeber & Kluckhohn, 1963; Williams 1983), which I do not seek to solve!
- 'To have and to have not?'
- The basis on which individuals make and remake meaning in a society. Associated with a group of people, a sense of belongingness and a basis for relating (Rustin 2007)
- At a macro level it surrounds us, and is present before our birth (Le Roy, 2000). At a micro level it is personal and influenced by the many groups to which we belong (Dalal, 2006; Moodley and Palmer, 2006) and by life events
- 'Race'; gender; class; sexual orientation; (dis)ability; religion; age; socioeconomic group; and language (Ivey and Simek, 1980; Moodley 2007)
- Plus many other things
- Metaculture (Tiryakian, 1996; Urban, 2001; Mulhearn, 2000)

Further complications

- Volatility
- Plasticity
- Contextuality (Ewing, 1990)
- Intersectionality (Burman, 2004)
- Virtually unlimited hierarchical distinctions
- Dimensions frequently come to stand in for each other (McLintock, 1995)

Literature review

- Culture in counselling and psychotherapy
  - Transcultural therapy
  - Cross-cultural therapy
  - Intercultural therapy
  - Multicultural therapy
- Theory of culture
  - Psychology
  - Sociology
  - Anthropology
George Devereux (1953)

- Psychoanalysis – operates beneath the level of culture
- Cross cultural psychotherapy – where the therapist utilises knowledge of the patient’s culture
- Transcultural therapy, in which the therapist utilises knowledge of ‘culture per se, and universal cultural categories’
- For Devereux, like Freud, the danger was not the cultural indifference of the therapist, but that interest in cultural factors could lead to long discourses, or to its use as a defence.

Culture in psychology

  - Definition of traits
  - Measurement of a population against these
  - Etc v Emic
  - Decolonizing methodology (Tuhiwai-Smith, 1999)
- Social identity theory (SIT) (Tajfel, 1978, 1982) or self categorisation theory (SCT) (Hogg and Abrahams, 1988)

Culture in sociology

- The dramaturgical approach (Goffman, 1971)

Theory of culture

- Winnicott’s location of culture
- Freud and the repetition compulsion
- Bowlby’s theory of childhood development
- Group analytic theory of culture
- Psychological anthropology

The location of cultural experience

(Winnicott, 1971)

- On the seashore of endless worlds, children play (Tagore)
- Transitional phenomenon located in the potential space between the individual and the environment (Winnicott, 1971: 135)
- ‘The potential space between baby and mother, between child and family, between individual and society or the world depends on experience which leads to trust. It can be looked on as sacred to the individual in that it is here that the individual experiences creative living’ (Winnicott, 1971: 135)
- At that point my subject widens out into that of play, and of artistic creativity and appreciation, and of religious feeling, and of dreaming … and also of fetishism, lying and stealing, the origin and loss of affectionate feeling, drug addiction, the talisman of obsessional rituals, etc. (Winnicott, 1971: 7)

The location of cultural experience

(Winnicott, 1971: 133)

When one speaks of a man, one speaks of him along with the summation of his cultural experiences. The whole forms a unit.

I have used the term cultural experience as an extension of the idea of transitional phenomena and of play without being certain that I can define the word ‘culture’. The accent indeed is on experience. In using the word culture I am thinking of the inherited tradition. I am thinking of something that is the common pool of humanity, into which individuals and groups of people may contribute, and from which we may all draw if we have somewhere to put what we find.
The repetition compulsion
(Freud, 2001 [1920]: 15-16)

- Fort-da game (Freud, 2001 [1920])
- ‘The interpretation of the game then became obvious. It was related to the child’s cultural achievement – the instinctual renunciation (that is the renunciation of instinctual satisfaction) which he had made in allowing his mother to go away without protesting. He compensated himself for this, as it were, by himself staging the disappearance and return of the objects within his reach’
- ‘Go to the front’

Childhood development (Bowlby, 1988, 1997)

Describes a toddler, who at the age of one or two years leaves its mother’s side for longer and more adventurous periods of exploration, but needs periodically to return; or to have the confidence that this is possible. As the child grows, it increasingly becomes able to internalise the mother so that longer periods of absence can be tolerated.

Group analytic theory of culture
(Le Roy, 2000)

- Every group has a culture
- Based on failed introjection or incorporation
- Groups become a repository for psychotic parts of self
- Loss of this containment is perceived as traumatic
- Traumatised subject will seek out replacement

Group analysis – Shifting gestalt

Group Analysis – framework for life

(Foulkes, 1948)

The influence of Norbert Elias

- A society of individuals
- Factors power into the understanding of culture
- Figurations:
  - The concept of figuration ... expresses what we call ‘society’ more clearly and unambiguously than the existing conceptual tools of sociology, as neither an abstraction of attributes of individuals existing without society nor a ‘system’ or ‘totality’ beyond individuals, but the network of interdependence formed by individuals (Elias, 2000, 214)
  - Process reduction
  - Our minds see states when there are only processes. Our minds are such that can only deal in finitudes, although the processes of existence are infinite. Consequently, our minds are obliged to break up infinite processes into bits and pieces. (Dalal, 2001)
Psychological anthropologists


Katherine Pratt Ewing

- Brings together anthropology and psychoanalysis especially Kohutian self psychology
- Focuses on the cultural shaping of authority relationships, cultural inconsistency and linkages between concepts of self and the politics of identity formation (Molino, 2004)
- Argues that individuals in all cultures 'project' [her word] multiple, inconsistent self-representations that are context dependent and may shift rapidly. These representations seem timeless and have histories of their own, which challenges traditional ideas in anthropology that cultures are coherent systems; and that there is a cultural self that can be classified in relation to the autonomous, cohesive, bounded Western self
- Illusion of wholeness (Ewing, 1990)
- Believes that individuals 'construct new selves from their available set of self-representations' (Ewing, 1990: 258)

Kathleen Stewart

- Shies away from many of the fundamentals of psychoanalysis, such as the distinction between conscious and unconscious, but acknowledges the influence of Lacan, Kristeva and Žižek
- Regards academic discourse as a critique that is contaminated by unspoken norms and practices (Stewart, 1991)
- Argues for the legitimacy of this contaminated cultural critique, suggesting that before we ask the 'seemingly straightforward' question of the social construction of the subject we need to ask about the cultural-political charge given to specific notions of the 'analyst' as 'subject' in conventions of academic discourse
- Culture no longer 'given', pre-constituted or 'out there', and has a vitality and creativity in which meanings is always in excess of what we can 'know'.

Is there anything beneath culture - 1

- Devereux (1995)
  - Psychoanalysis
  - Cross-cultural psychotherapy
  - Trans-cultural psychotherapy
- Foulkes (1966: 152)saw the individual as 'preconditioned to the core by his community even before he is born, and … imprinted vitally by the group which brings him up'
- Hearst (1993: 403)believed that this was possible to get beneath culture; referring to 'basic irreducible and universal needs of the infant, irrespective of cultural heritage'

Is there anything beneath culture - 2

- Dalal (1993: 406) rejects this approach and addresses the question of the infant – mother relationship by arguing that love and need are as much cultural as instinctual
- Christmas truce 1914
  - On December 7, 1914, Pope Benedict XV suggested a temporary hiatus of the war for the celebration of Christmas. The warring countries refused to create any official cease-fire, but on Christmas the soldiers in the trenches declared their own unofficial truce
- Therapy as enculturation (Fancher, 1993; Kakar, 2007)

Defensive use of culture (Dalal, 2006)

- A female client used religious devotion to counteract denigration within her husband's family. Couple were both second generation immigrants into the UK; born into secular Muslim families from the same sect, class and country of origin. However the husband's family, with whom the couple lived, seemed to regard the wife's background as inferior.
- A black group member concealed from the group the fact that his wife was pregnant. When the group challenged him on this, he 'played the culture card' to close the door on further exploration
Cultural trauma

- Occurs 'when members of a collectivity feel that they have been subjected to a horrendous event that leaves indelible marks upon their group consciousness' (Alexander, 2004: 1)
- *Lay trauma theory* asserts that the traumatising event is distorted and repressed by defences that protect the collectivity from the intensity of the pain. But trauma can only be resolved 'when memory comes' (Friedlander, 1979)
- This suffers from a 'naturalistic fallacy'. Alexander believes main factor is socially mediated attribution and damage suffered to the identity of the collectivity rather than any physical injury.
- Cultural traumas are used by members of collectivities to share suffering
- Used by *collectivity* to create an identity (Alexander, 2004; Hopper, 1997; Rice & Benson, 2005; Volkan, 2001)

Thought paralysis (Dalal, 2012)

- Thought paralysis: The virtues of discrimination
- Argues that political correctness acts against real equality by paralysing the ability to think.
- Culture and diversity are emphasised, loosing sight of issues of power and diversity
- Meanwhile prejudice and bigotry go underground but continue to blight lives

Cultural stereotypes

- Often seen as restrictive, reductionist and unhelpful.
- However stereotyping is a normal cognitive process with practical uses (Brislin, 1993; Jahoda, 1978)
- May be inherent in the operation of the brain (Adler, 2000)
- So stereotypes can be useful as long as it is understood that they are just stereotypes – or cultural resources
- Easier to talk about your own cultural stereotypes than those of others
- Scottish stereotype of meanness (MacDonald, 2007)
- Can be used as a resource for identification and projection.
- Scot may identify with the stereotype, justifying meanness; or project it onto another individual, groups or the entire nation; leaving him or her free to practice generosity, and derive disproportionate self-satisfaction.

Findings

- Three ideas
  - Cultural identity
  - Culture as resource
  - Personal culture
- Three superordinate metacultural themes
  - Influence of personal
  - Belongingness
  - Growth
- Culture as transitional object
- Culture as attachment system
- Culture as repetition compulsion

Three ideas – cultural identity

- Approaches identity through identification in both psychoanalytic and discursive sense
- Theory of suture (Miller, 1978; Silverman, 1983; Hall, 1996)
- The meeting point, the point of *suture*, between on the one hand the discourses and practices which attempt to 'interpellate', speak to us or hail us into place as the social subjects of particular discourses, and on the other hand, the processes which produce subjectivities, which construct us as subjects which can be 'spoken'. Identities are thus points of temporary attachment to the subject positions which discursive practices construct for us (Hall, 1996: 6)
- Suture names the relation of the subject to its chain of disclosure … it figures there as the element which is lacking, in the form of a stand-in (Miller, 1978)
- Cultural identity is a volatile and ever changing entity

Suture

- *Suture*, literally meaning "seam" ...Surgical *suture*, a stitch used by doctors and surgeons to hold tissue together

Wikipedia
Three ideas – culture as a resource

- Culture is not just something that we have, that we own or that owns us: it is also something that we use consciously or unconsciously, that we may seek to acquire or customise.
- At a more conscious level we may employ it to gain influence, status or access.
- However, this is not the whole story.
- It is also used unconsciously and defensively.

Idea found widely in discourse analysis, and by implication in psychoanalysis.

Three ideas – culture as a resource

- Cultural resources are real phenomena or discursive constructions that originate in the outer world, but are usually made personal through the psychoanalytic processes of introjection and incorporation and the social constructionist process of internalisation (Berger & Luckmann, 1966). Berger (1967; 1999) goes on to develop this into a theory of religion, cults and new religious movements (Dawson, 2008).
- They are used consciously or unconsciously to achieve an objective.

The ego of Tony Soprano and its mechanisms of defence

- Although cultural identity is useful it is not enough (IMHO).
- Personal culture appears in various places (e.g. Dalal, 2006; Winnicott, 1971; Ewing, 1997).
- It is the collection of cultural resources habitually employed by an individual.
- Multiple identities with ‘the illusion of wholeness’ (Ewing, 1990).
- Eventually seek consistency.

Belongingness – Sigmund Freud

- Born 6th May 1856 in small Moravian town of Freiburg, then in Austro-Hungarian Empire.
- Believed that his father’s family had lived for a long time in Cologne, but fled east to escape persecution in the fourteenth or fifteenth century, migrating back to German Austria in the nineteenth century.
- First languages Czech and Yiddish.
- Trained, lived and worked in Vienna.
- Famously atheist.
- In 1926, he told an interviewer ‘My language is German. My culture, my attainments are German. I considered myself German intellectually, until I noticed the growth of antisemitic prejudice in Germany and German Austria. Since that time, I prefer to call myself a Jew’ (Gay, 1988: 448).

Ways of accessing cultural resources

- Relationships.
- Marriage.
- Travel.
- Migration.
- Career.
- Hobbies.
- Mode of dress, behaviour, speech.
Mechanisms that become resources in themselves

- Cultural appropriation
- Cultural appreciation
- Cultural fraud

Cultural criminals? – Elvis and Justin Bieber

Cultural fraud – Rachel Dolezal

Research and clinical data

- Research data
  - Clara
  - Mhairi
  - Rachel
  - Erika
- Clinical data
  - Saleh
  - Claudine

Selection criteria for research participants

- Participants should have approached, crossed or positioned themselves on cultural boundaries through migration, travel, relationships etc.
- Interest in work
- Experience of life
- Avoided people whose cultural identity was dominated by one dimension of difference

Clara – the search for a home

- 62 f
- Only child of English father and Austrian mother
- Married to black man – couple have two children
- Up to age of 16 accompanied parents on father’s overseas postings
- In Libya she had a black nanny
- At age 11 sent to boarding school
- In times of difficulty returned to structures of forces and sought out friends with similar background
- Sought out relationships with other races
- Husband is also of mixed race and has forces background
- Couple travel extensively and collect artefacts from countries they visit
Clara – transcultural commentary
- Weak and split sense of belongingness
- Peripatetic lifestyle
- Boarding school
- Probably established secure attachment to black Libyan nanny
- In times of anxiety sought out security in forces background
- Motivated to seek out relationships with foreigners
- Deeply hurt by racism of parents
- Dated and ultimately married black man of mixed heritage and forces background
- Engaged in ‘search for richness’

Mhairi – the search for belonging
- 55 f
- Born in south of England to Scottish parents
- Strong Scottish influence
- Spoke differently
- Attracted to outsiders (ethnically or in terms of illness or learning difficulties)
- Younger sister and a daughter and grandson who live in London
- Been in lesbian relationship with a black woman of mixed race for over 10 years
- Now lives in Edinburgh near to maternal aunt, but has no friends in Scotland
- Travels extensively to increasingly remote countries
- Learned Urdu, Mongolian, Cantonese

Mhairi – transcultural commentary
- Lacked sense of belonging
- Sense of belonging was to something ‘out there’ that could be visited before returning to a place of safety
- Idea of speaking out and being understood
- Identification with outsider or foreigner
- Moved to Scotland close to maternal aunt, which became a place of safety but not belonging
- Need to travel further in search of the need to belong – India, Mongolia, Timbuktu

Sexuality
- then I come to counselling … and I had to do a (.) placement (.) and … I started being a counsellor at xxxxxxxxxx … and there was this group of (.) outspoken women that knew about politics (847-851)
- this is a kind of coming home place for me (.) that seemed very ordinary … and again … of course that is about more than who my partner is … that is a cultural identity (861-863)

Travel
- I’ve got a yearning to go to Timbuktu … and I’m sure it’s that kind of thing about how far out can you go … OK … how much further is Timbuktu … and … partly I think … how much further is Outer Mongolia … well I’ve been there now (1330-1333)
- I do think that culture is the Golden Temple thing (.) the excitement (.) and the (. ) sparkle (.) [that] I see (.) outside (.) I just don’t see that sparkle inside me (1309-1312)
- I’m left with that (.) thing around … am I empty (2) but then (1) maybe I need to reframe that in a more positive place about holding the bareness (.) that I’m all of it (.) and the culture as well (1423-1426)

Rachel – the girl in the corner
- 52 f
- Divorced with two children
- Youngest of three children
- Did well at school and succeeded in everything she attempted
- Things were going on ‘beneath the surface’
- Always sought out her own circle of friends
- Driven to travel, to seek out conflict and to live on cultural fault lines (Hiroshima, Pacific islands, Tanzania, Barcelona)
- Happier living as an expat although not ‘expatty’ person
Rachel – transcultural commentary

- Secure sense of belongingness, both personal and cultural
- Prefers to live outside place of belonging, to seek out places of cultural conflict or destruction; and people who are similarly minded

Erika – The cosmopolitan

- 32 f
- Unmarried
- Only child born in Poland
- Escaped Poland at age of 3 via Italy to Canada
- Parents divorced
- Mother unsettled lifestyle
- Does not feel either Polish or Canadian
- Strong spiritual dimension to life
- Cosmopolitan outlook
- Attracted to culturally different

Erica – transcultural commentary

- Lacked a place of authentic belonging
- Preferred to live between, with a base in her two places of partial belonging and in UK which is between
- Sought sense of belonging in spiritual beliefs and in the idea of cosmopolitanism
- Happier with people who share these beliefs and who also have a split sense of belonging

Guidelines for culturally informed counselling and psychotherapy

1. Pay attention to culture and cultural difference
2. Try not to make assumptions about the culture of a client on the basis of appearances or pre-conceptions
3. Take a wide view of culture and its many dimensions and influences rather than immediately focusing on the obvious
4. Notice which dimensions are emphasised and which are minimised
5. Think about the cultural resources that a client uses or does not use
6. Think about the cultural resources that a client has sought out through relationships, employment, travel, religion, migration, participation in hobbies or sports, appreciation of art or popular culture
7. Think about the cultural resources that a client has sought out through relationships, employment, travel, religion, migration, participation in hobbies or sports, appreciation of art or popular culture
8. Think about culture as a communication about the life of the client
9. Be prepared to engage with the cultural issues at a surface level
10. Be attentive to the defensive use of culture
11. Be prepared to challenge these defences in a careful manner
12. Consider the timing and manner of cultural interpretations carefully
13. Pay particular attention to the way in which culture manifests itself in the transference

Fit with therapeutic modalities

- Psychoanalytic
- Person-centred
- Cognitive-Behavioural
Exercise

- Split into groups of 2/3
- Allocate roles of counsellor / client (/observer)
- Spend 10 minutes talking about the client's culture
- Debrief for 5 minutes
- Change over
- Repeat

Guidance for counsellors

- Keep approach open
- Use questions like
  - Tell me about your childhood?
  - What was that like for you?
  - What cultural influences did you have?
- Avoid plunging interpretations – keep subtle or use skills like summarising, paraphrasing
- Avoid intrusion
  - 'Clients' should not go anywhere they do not want
  - Therapists use phrases like 'I want us to focus on cultural influences'

Model to keep in mind

Objective domain

Subjective domain

Cultural domain

Terrorism (Varvin, 2003)

- Violence from above – by states to secure political power or give a message to a third party
- Violence from below – by individuals, groups or networks to force political change or draw attention to a political or religious message

Terrorism as Cultural Resource: The rampant nationalist Scotsman

A more or less superficial layer of the unconscious is undoubtedly personal. I call it the personal unconscious. But this personal unconscious rests upon a deeper layer, which does not derive from personal experience and is not a personal acquisition but is inborn. This deeper layer I call the collective unconscious.

(Jung, 1968: 3)

Cultural Identity (Hall, 1996: 5)

The meeting point, the point of suture, between on the one hand the discourses and practices which attempt to 'interpellate', speak to us or hail us into place as the social subjects of particular discourses, and on the other hand, the processes which produce subjectivities, which construct us as subjects which can be 'spoken'. Identities are thus points of temporary attachment to the subject positions which discursive practices construct for us.
Rob
- 58 year old male
- Born and brought up in the then industrialised West of Scotland
- Lives in Edinburgh
- Retired marine engineer
- Active Scottish Nationalist

The Rampant Nationalist Scotsman (RNS)

Pete
- 28 year old male
- Born in a small village in the East of Scotland
- Attended University in Scotland
- Moved to England to find work
- Engaged to an English girl
- Hoped eventually to move back to Scotland

G: [LAUGHS]
P: It’s brilliant because it’s … you know … just so ridiculous.
G: It is ridiculous … but there’s something quite sinister … isn’t there?
P: Aye … I mean that whole character’s sort of like a pastiche of … ehh … I mean everyone recognises it because everyone knows people like that … that are just … awe English … we hate the English … it’s just something you say … you know there are people (2) mainly people who … emm … never been to England.
Another Cultural Resource

Implications for counselling and therapy

Terrorism as a Human phenomenon

Final Thought - Terrorist as Scapegoat

A live goat over whose head Aaron confessed all the sins of the children of Israel on the Day of Atonement. The goat, symbolically bearing their sins, was then sent into the wilderness.

Radicalisation and fundamentalism

Research from the International Centre for the Study of Radicalisation and Political Violence (ICSR) argues that the root causes of radicalisation are issues of identity (Maher, 2015), and that cultural awareness is a factor that contributes to the effectiveness of programmes of de-radicalisation (El-Said, 2012)

Conclusion

- Culture as a universal human phenomenon
- Approach that supplements rather than replaces other approaches
- Fundamental requirement is for reflexivity
- Can be engaged in the process of therapy
- Can illuminate human processes